Flowchart for critique articles

Critique article submitted

Single article criticised

Multiple articles criticised

Critique refers to article published in a non-IUCr journal. Refer critique authors back to original journal

Critique refers to article published in an IUCr journal

Critique refers to articles that are all published in the same non-IUCr journal. Refer critique authors back to original journal

Critique refers to articles published in multiple journals

Co-editor reports to Main Editor and Managing Editor, reassign if appropriate

Co-editor reports to Main Editors and Managing Editor, reassign if appropriate*

*Main Editors also agree which of the criticised authors need to be contacted

Inform authors of IUCr procedure and discuss possible outcomes

Inform authors of IUCr procedure and discuss possible outcomes

Authors willing for editor to contact original authors?

YES   NO

Authors willing for editor to contact original authors?

YES   NO

Possible outcomes:
1. Nothing – resolution by discussion between the parties
2. Corrigendum – original authors write corrigendum, agreed by both parties
3. Critique article and response written, review in tandem by same referees*
4. Critique article only, follow usual peer review procedure*

*Ensure careful choice of experienced and neutral referees

Critique article peer-reviewed as usual, with careful choice of experienced and neutral referees. Prior to publication, accepted version of critique sent to original authors for their response

Possible outcomes:
1. Nothing – resolution by discussion between the parties
2. Corrigenda – for an IUCr journal original authors write corrigendum, agreed by both parties
3. Multiple responses and critique article reviewed together by same referees*
4. Combined response from multiple authors and critique article reviewed together by same referees*
5. Critique article only, follow usual peer review procedure*
6. Some combination of the above

*Ensure careful choice of experienced and neutral referees

Critique article peer-reviewed as usual, with careful choice of experienced and neutral referees. Prior to publication, accepted version of critique sent to criticised authors for their responses. Depending on the nature of the criticism, there may be multiple responses and/or a combined response

Ideally, critique and response published as consecutive articles in the same issue of the journal. This means delaying publication of the critique article until the response has been received and reviewed

Ideally, critique and response(s) published as consecutive articles in the same issue of the journal. This means delaying publication of the critique article until the response(s) have been received and reviewed